

## BACKGROUND PAPER A: LESSONS FROM INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE

A1 This review draws on international experience in managing the marine environment. It focuses primarily on relevant experience from marine protected areas in other parts of the world that were established for broadly similar purposes to those that a coastal and marine national park (CMNP) might have in Scotland, whether or not they are actually called Parks (see Table 1 for an overview of those used in this review). Most of these examples are from temperate regions. The paper also considers key lessons from broader, integrated coastal zone management initiatives. For simplicity, CMNP is used as a general term to refer to these areas.

### IUCN/WCPA Guidelines for Marine Protected Areas

A2 The International Union for the Protection of Nature (IUCN) and World Commission on Protected Areas (WCPA) have established guidelines for Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) which are shown in Box 1. Steps 4, 7 and 8 are all considered to be essential to step 6 *Planning and managing MPAs*, but are considered of sufficient importance to warrant being highlighted as steps in their own right. In Scotland, the existing legislation effectively underpins steps 2 to 5. The focus of this review is therefore on relevant aspects of 1, and 6 to 9.

#### *Box 1 IUCN/WCPA Guidelines for Marine Protected Areas*

1. Placing MPAs in their wider context
2. Developing the legal framework
3. Working with relevant sectors
4. Making partnerships with communities and other stakeholders
5. Selecting the sites for MPAs
6. Planning and managing MPAs
7. Zoning
8. Planning for financial sustainability
9. Ensuring research, monitoring, evaluation and review

### Review of lessons from international experience

A3 CMNPs vary significantly in size, from just a few km<sup>2</sup> through to several thousand km<sup>2</sup>. The largest CMNP - the Great Barrier Reef National Park in Australia - is 343,800 km<sup>2</sup> (some four times the area of Scotland's territorial waters) though this scale of Park is very much an exception even in Australia.

A4 The **scale** of a CMNP is related to its aims and objectives. Most CMNPs with primary objectives which relate to the conservation and enjoyment of an area tend to be relatively small. In essence, these are more akin to Scotland's

SSSIs, NNRs and Natura 2000 sites than to Scotland's National Parks. However, larger CMNPs tend to have a wider set of objectives, including those relating to sustainable use. Whichever approach is adopted, it is important to recognise that there will be broader issues such as climate change which a CMNP is unable to address, but which can still have major implications for the sustainable use of a CMNP.

- A5 Experience indicates the importance of the wider **context** within which a CMNP operates both in terms of policy development and management. At a regional scale this includes, for example, viewing management of the natural heritage within the wider ecosystem of which the CMNP is a part and linking into the development of adjacent communities as part of a broader socio-economic region. At a national scale the designation of a CMNP, together with other types of MPA and ICZM initiatives, may make an important contribution towards an overall national approach to the conservation and sustainable use of a nation's maritime natural heritage. Equally, the effectiveness of a CMNP is strengthened when planning and management are supported by a range of other national and international approaches.
- A6 The decision as to where the **area** of a CMNP is defined and its detailed boundary drawn depends partly on the way in which the coastal zone is viewed/defined in a particular country. The landward extent may include intertidal areas, coastal habitats such as sand dunes or, in some cases, the settlements of communities with strong links to the sea. The decision may include consideration of a range of factors such as land use, landscape, river basins, existing administrative boundaries, cultural heritage, geology, sedimentary processes and biodiversity. The decision on the seaward extent will include consideration of some of these as well as factors such as seabed topography, bathymetry and hydrography. For both the landward and seaward components, if there are issues arising from land/water use which a CMNP is intended to address, it is important that the areas in which these practices occur are included, or are managed in co-ordination with the Park area.
- A7 The planning and management of most CMNP involves the preparation of some form of **marine spatial plan**. Although the concept of marine spatial planning is not new, CMNPs often provide a focus for planning for future change in an integrated manner, across the land/sea interface and between different sectoral interests. In general, larger CMNP tend to develop more sophisticated marine spatial plans, with systems of zoning to accommodate multiple use and to help achieve a wider range of management objectives. Implementation is most effective where other regulators/users of a CMNP are given a legal responsibility to take account of the marine spatial plan, but support from stakeholders is also crucial. Whichever tools are used, it is important that planning and management of a CMNP is done in a manner which is consistent with the principles of Integrated Coastal Zone Management (see Box 2). There is considerable experience of the added-value that these approaches bring to coastal and marine management, both within the UK and overseas.

## Box 2 EU ICZM principles

A broad, holistic perspective  
A long-term perspective  
Adaptive management during a gradual process  
Reflecting local specificity  
Working with natural processes  
Participatory planning  
Support and involvement of all relevant administrative bodies  
Use of a combination of instruments

- A8 CMNPs with a sustainable use objective are generally set up specifically to engage and involve **communities** and other relevant stakeholders in the planning and governance of their areas. There are many challenges involved, not least because these communities are often remote, relatively small and dispersed. Different communities within a CMNP may also see themselves as having distinctly different needs and aspirations. The importance of understanding local communities and their needs and being able to respond to them is increasingly recognised as being key to the long-term success of a CMNP.
- A9 The interaction between the natural heritage and **fisheries** is seen as one of the key management issues within CMNPs. In smaller CMNPs, whose primary objectives are conservation-focussed, fishing activity is generally restricted across the CMNP or banned altogether. Within larger CMNP, zoning is used to reduce conflict with other sectors and with sensitive habitats and species. Management mechanisms range from voluntary codes of conduct through to restrictions on gear type and effort. The main objectives of the introduction of fisheries management measures within most CMNPs is to ensure conservation, or to ensure conservation and the sustainable use of the area by fisheries – the latter approach can bring benefits to fisheries management through the protection and enhancement of commercial fish stocks. In situations where fishing practices are considered to be sustainable, CMNP may play a role in increasing the marketability of local fish and fish products.
- A10 The increased focus on managing for conservation and/or sustainable use of the natural heritage means that CMNPs are often used to **pilot new ways of working**. The greater integration within a CMNP may provide an overview which enables systems to be set up which link different geographic areas and/or sectors and meet their needs, allowing them to operate more effectively. Additional resources associated with a CMNP may also be used to assist the development of new techniques. Examples include combined marketing of visitor facilities or local produce and improved provision of public transport. Pilot projects potentially have benefits not only for CMNPs but also for other areas, as the lessons that are learnt are used to develop best practice which can be applied more widely to management of marine and coastal environments.

- A11 Generally, the level of **knowledge and understanding** of the cultural and natural heritage within a CMNP is lower than for terrestrial parks, both amongst the general public and those responsible for management. The environment may not be as generally accessible to the public and there may be a need for more innovative approaches to interpretation. The resource implications of gathering data are also greater than for terrestrial parks. Experience from other CMNPs highlights the importance of complementing data collected as part of formal monitoring programmes with knowledge from local communities and other users of the marine environment, including fishermen. This is a key element of engaging with stakeholders. CMNPs can provide an important focus for education effort and for increasing knowledge of the marine and coastal environment and how best to manage it.
- A12 CMNPs can play an important role in increasing opportunities for recreation and enjoyment and for increasing income from **tourism**. The separate review of this subject we commissioned found many examples which demonstrated innovation in the development of new visitor products and services (see Box 3) It is particularly important that different stakeholders work together to ensure that the **provision of services and facilities** is integrated, encouraging exploration and bringing benefits to communities across the CMNP. This is an area in which the focus provided by CMNPs is often used to develop new ways of working and best practice, as discussed above. The development of strong partnerships, which include private sector interests, to develop and implement sustainable visitor and tourism strategies based on the long-term resource management is key here. These strategies must be set within the overall context of the CMNP plan.

*Box 3 Key features and good practice examples from sustainable tourism projects in coastal and marine National Parks*

Marketing and branding	Branding of products, quality marque for local produce; crafts and merchandise, marketing of Park experience, market research; high quality websites
Communications	Advisory committees comprising communities, local businesses, users and other stakeholders; High quality websites; photography competitions, shoreline improvement schemes, 'friends of' organisations; community newsletters,
Visitor management	Touring routes, trails, paths and dives, voluntary codes of conduct for recreational user groups, tour operator permits, zoning of recreational use (spatial and temporal), provision of TIC and support centres; guided boat tours using traditional boats
Interpretation	Interpretative plan, themed guided walks and tours, networks of 'discovery' centres and museums; range of interpretative media, coastal and marine ranger services, multilingual interpretation media; promotion of quality local merchandise
Community development	Business advice, support and development, investment in gateway communities; ecotourism

	enterprise development; private sector involvement in managing Park facilities; local community trusts to own and manage land/facilities; regeneration of local crafts and produce
Environmental enhancement	Litter removal and keep park tidy schemes; tourism operators involved in scientific research; voluntary tourism levy to support environmental improvements
Sustainable transport	Public transport information; shuttle bus services, solar powered boats, promotion of cruises and trips in traditional sailing and fishing boats

A13 Finally, there are many examples where CMNPs have provided direct **social and economic benefits**, both to communities within the CMNP, but also those outside it and the wider region within which the CMNP sits. Most of these benefits result from increases in recreation and tourism in the area. Benefits also accrue from the support and promotion of local products, including food and traditional crafts. Greater care of the marine environment of a CMNP can also benefit those who draw their livelihood from the natural resources of the area, including fishermen.

## Conclusions

A14 The key lessons from this review of international experience are as follows.

- CMNPs with a wider range of aims and objectives, including those for sustainable use and community development, tend to be larger than CMNPs which are primarily concerned with conservation.
- It is important to recognise the context within which a CMNP is set, both in terms of the ecosystem of which the CMNP is part and wider policy development.
- Decisions as to where CMNP are located and their boundaries are drawn are based on a range of factors including physical, biological, administrative and cultural factors, including the way in which the coast is defined in that country.
- Planning and management of most CMNP involves the preparation of some form of marine spatial plan with varying degrees of complexity depending upon the range of management objectives within a CMNP.
- Being able to understand local communities and their needs and respond to them is important for the long-term success of a CMNP.
- Most CMNP have an involvement in fisheries management. Although there may be benefits to fisheries, the primary objective of the introduction of most fisheries management measures is to ensure conservation and/or sustainable use of the CMNP.
- CMNPs are often used to pilot new ways of working, which potentially have benefits for areas outwith CMNPs as the lessons that are learnt are used to develop best practice.
- CMNPs can provide an important focus for increasing knowledge and

- understanding of the marine and coastal environment.
- CMNPs can play an important role in increasing the opportunities for recreation and enjoyment and for increasing the income from tourism received by local communities.

A number of examples illustrating aspects of this best practice are provided in background paper B.

## References

- Bishop K, Green M and Phillips A (1998), *Models of National parks*, SNH report No:105
- Dower D, Buller H and Asamer-Handler M (1998) *The socio-economic benefits of National parks: a review*, SNH report No:104.
- Gubbay, S (2000) *Marine National Parks. A Briefing Paper for WWF Scotland*.
- International Council for Exploration of the Seas (ICES) (April 2004) *Working Group on Ecosystem Effects of Fishing Activities*.
- James, B (2003) *Marine National Parks in Scotland*. Ecological Advisers Unit, Scottish Executive.
- Kelleher G. (1999) *Guidelines for Marine Protected Areas Best Practice Protected Area Guidelines Series No 3*, IUCN/WCPA.
- Kindleysides, D, (April 2004). *Marine National Parks in Scotland. A Discussion Paper* RSPB Scotland.
- Marine Protected Area Management Effectiveness Initiative website (<http://www.effectivempa.noaa.gov/welcome.html>). UKOOA & WWF International.
- Roff, J. C. & Associates. (2002). *Analysis of the Scale Issues on Marine Ecosystem Processes in Relation to Defining the Boundaries of Marine Protection Areas*. SNH Report No: F01AA413.
- Royal Commission on Environmental Pollution (December 2004). Twenty-fifth Report, *Turning the Tide - Addressing the impact of Fisheries on the Marine Environment*. Chapter 8, 'Marine Protected Areas'.
- Scottish Coastal Forum (2004) *A Strategy for Scotland's Coast and Inshore Waters*.
- Stevens and Associates (2006) *A review of relevant experience and best practice in sustainable tourism in the coastal and marine environment*, SNH Draft Report, unpublished.
- Wills, R, (2001) *The Sustainable Development Opportunities and Issues Presented by Marine National Parks in Scotland*. A Discussion Paper for SNH and WWF in Scotland WWF

**Table 1: Overview of relevant approaches to coastal and marine National Parks in different countries**

Country	Relevant protected areas	Overview
England and Wales	National Parks, Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty, Heritage Coasts	There are 37 Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB) in England and Wales and 12 National Parks. While none have any jurisdiction below MLWM, 7 of the 12 Parks and over half of AONBs have a coastal component. Both are designated under the National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act. In addition, there are 42 non-statutory heritage coast partnerships. AONBs are intended to be precious landscapes whose distinctive character and natural beauty are so outstanding that it is in the nation's interest to safeguard them. The primary purpose of an AONB is to conserve and enhance the natural beauty of the landscape. The secondary aims are to meet the need for quiet enjoyment of the countryside and to have regard for the interests of those who live and work there. The purpose of National Parks in England and Wales are to conserve and enhance the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Parks and to promote opportunities for the public understanding and enjoyment of the special qualities of the Parks.
France	Regional Parks, Biosphere Reserves	There are 43 <i>parcs naturels regionaux</i> in France. They vary in size between 260 and 3000km <sup>2</sup> . Their purpose is to protect and enhance the natural and cultural heritage and to assist in the social and economic regeneration of rural, mountain and maritime areas. Biosphere reserves tend to be smaller with areas identified as core zones with strict protection, surrounded by larger buffer and co-operation zones. In addition to conservation, research, training, and education there is an increasing focus on sustainable development within these reserves. Land within both types of areas is not necessarily state-owned.
Finland	National Parks	There are four National Parks in Finland with a marine and/or coastal element. They were all designated under the Nature Conservation Act and vary in size between 52 and 500 km <sup>2</sup> . National Parks are protected areas which are intended to include habitats and landforms that are characteristic of Finland. All four National Parks include archipelago systems. Nature conservation is the primary function and economic activities which would disturb the environment are excluded. Within the limitations imposed by the conservation aims, National Parks must also contribute to environmental education, scientific research and outdoor recreation.

		Fishing and hunting are seen as contrary to the conservation aims of the park, although may be allowed through permits. Provision is made for stakeholder involvement in planning within National Parks. All National Parks are on state-owned land.
Sweden	National Parks	There are 10 National Parks in Sweden with a marine and/or coastal element, ranging in size from between 0.3km <sup>2</sup> to 100km <sup>2</sup> . Provision is made for National Parks under the Nature Conservancy Act but they must all be designated under separate acts of parliament. National Parks are intended to be representative biotopes which are preserved in their natural state, but which can also be used for outdoor recreation and research, provided that the environment is not threatened by these activities. National Parks are afforded higher levels of protection than any other type of designation in Sweden and are intended to ensure ecologically sound management. There are strict controls on certain types of activity e.g. hunting and camping away from authorised sites. All land within National Parks must be owned by the state.
Germany	National Parks, Biosphere Reserves	The Wadden Sea Region is approximately 22,000km <sup>2</sup> and is managed through a Tri-lateral agreement between the Netherlands, Denmark and Germany. A secretariat was established to facilitate and co-ordinate collaboration in planning and management at an international level and has resulted in a Trilateral Wadden Sea Plan. The Region is managed for sustainable use. A series of National Parks underpins the Wadden Sea Area which falls under the jurisdiction of Germany. These are designated under the National Park Law. This legislation was amended in 1999 and now requires management to have due regard for the economic and social well-being of the regional population, in addition to existing nature conservation aims.
Canada	Marine Parks, National Marine Conservation Areas	National Parks are established to protect outstanding representative examples of natural areas in Canada. They are established under the National Parks Act to allow people to enjoy them as special places without damaging their ecological integrity. National Marine Conservation Areas have been introduced more recently and are designated under the National Marine Conservation Areas Act. The first two NMCA resulted from the reclassification of existing National Parks with marine components. NMCA were created to reflect a slightly different focus to National

		<p>Parks; they are intended to be managed for sustainable use but also contain smaller zones of high protection. The different types of MPA and, in particular, the identification of new MPA are clearly set within the context of building a national MPA network for Canada. This is, in turn, set within the wider context of the Government's Ocean Action Plan.</p>
United States	National Parks, National Marine Sanctuaries	<p>There are 13 National Marine Sanctuaries in the United States. They are designated under the National Marine Sanctuaries Act and together encompass more than 388,500 km<sup>2</sup> of marine and Great Lakes waters. Sanctuaries may be designated for conservation, recreation, ecology, history, research, education or aesthetic resources. They are managed to protect and conserve natural and cultural resources and allow uses that are compatible with resource protection. National Parks are created through acts of Congress. They are intended to preserve unimpaired the natural and cultural resources and values of an area for the enjoyment, education, and inspiration of this and future generations. Systems of regulations and permits are used to manage activity in both.</p>
New Zealand	Marine Parks	<p>There are three Marine Parks in New Zealand. Two are designated under the Fisheries and/or Harbours Acts and one through specific legislation (the Hauraki Gulf Marine Park Act). They vary in size between 6 and 20 km<sup>2</sup>. In addition, seven of New Zealand's National Parks have a coastal element. These are designated under the National Parks Act whose provisions only apply above high water. National Parks aim to preserve areas for their intrinsic value as well as for the benefit, use and enjoyment of the public. Permits are required to undertake some activities including fishing, hunting and commercial operations. Marine Parks also aim to protect the environment and have control over fishing and other activities. Neither National or Marine Parks are as highly protected as Marine Reserves (designated under the Marine Reserves Act) which are No Take Zones. Experience to date has led to strong stakeholder support, particularly from fisheries interests.</p>